Does lobbying benefit society?
Yes!

Brian Kelleher Richter
University of Texas at Austin McCombs School

Rutgers QUASI Seminar
January 22 2021
Conceptions of lobbying
Lobbying is widely viewed negatively... Below Used Car Sales, Congress, Telemarketers
Lobbying is widely viewed negatively...

Below Used Car Sales, Congress, Telemarketers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>Very high/High</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Low/Very low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nurses</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacists</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical doctors</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school teachers</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police officers</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clergy</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funeral directors</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountants</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalists</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bankers</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building contractors</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyers</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate agents</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor union leaders</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business executives</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stockbrokers</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising practitioners</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car salespeople</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of Congress</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telemarketers</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lobbyists</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
<td><strong>60</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gallup's 2015 Honesty and Ethics of Professions Ratings

Please tell me how you would rate the honesty and ethical standards of people in these different fields -- very high, high, average, low or very low?

Sorted by very high/high

Dec. 2-5, 2015

GALLUP
Lobbying is widely viewed negatively...
Not surprising given common images/conceptions
Lobbying is widely viewed negatively...
Not surprising given common images/conceptions
So What is Lobbying?
So What is Lobbying?
Definition and Un-definition

• Lobbying is:
  • “the transfer of information ... between interest groups and politicians, their staffs, and agents” (deFiguieredo & Richter 2014)

• Lobbying is not:
  • Transfer of $$$ between firms & politicians
  • Other forms of corporate political activity, e.g. campaign contributions, independent expenditures, leveraging social connections
First Amendment to the US Constitution protects lobbying as a profession

“Congress shall make no law ... prohibiting the free exercise thereof or abridging the freedom ... to petition the Government for a redress of grievances”

Critical role of factions in Federalist #10
So What is Lobbying?
Fundamentally about Information Provision

• Time constrained politicians require information to make tradeoffs in policymaking
  • Why most formal/theoretical models of lobbying are *informational* in nature, e.g. Hall & Deardorff (2006)
  • Other *quid pro quo* models of bribes exist, but don’t map well to institutional realities
  • Kim & Siegel (2020) conduct an empirical horse race showing informational view dominates nefarious bribe/corruption view
So What is Lobbying?

Fundamentally about Information Provision

• Even for-hire, revolving door lobbyists trade in something fundamentally beyond connections
• Can see this in examining revolvers’ revenue after connected politician exits Congress

• Why? Because *information* can be many things:
  • A given politicians’ quirks/constituent tastes
  • Knowledge of political processes/industries

Blanes-i-Vidal, Draka, Fons-Rosen (2012)
When is Lobbying Effective?
When is lobbying effective?

Policy Status Quo dominates even with Lobbying

- Large literature on status quo bias in policymaking across academic fields
  - Most legislation dies or gets voted down
- Largest study of lobbying conducted in Political Science finds nothing happens >60% of the time
  
  Baumgartner et al (2009)

- In Management literature, efficacy of corporate political activity also questioned given null/negative effects on firm performance

  Hadani & Schuler (2013)
When is lobbying effective?  

Why the Policy Status Quo dominates

• Competition among pressure groups erodes bias in one direction or another (Becker 1983)
  • Therefore, consensus is needed among interest groups to yield outcomes/compromise
  • This is socially beneficial
  • It also keeps many groups from lobbying in the first place

[Fact: Only ~10% of publicly traded firms choose to lobby in the US]
When is lobbying effective?
When the Policy Status Quo fails & We get Change

• Coalitions are critically important to lobbying success
  • Yet, they tend not to work when they are pure business or industry coalitions
  • They work best when they are unconventional and include firms and unlikely allies from non-profit or citizen group world
• We see this in many contexts:
  • European Parliament (Junk 2013)
  • US Rulemaking (Nelson & Yackee 2012)
When is lobbying effective? Why the Policy Status Quo dominates

• Surprising coalitions that demonstrate expertise/credible information on multiple fronts work best
• Fremeth & Richter (2012) show this via Hewlett-Packard’s electronic waste efforts
  • HP innovated to internalize/reduce harms of eWaste and recycle them in a “green bundle”
  • Worked with environmental groups
  • Successfully created more efficient environmental laws than POS tax
• Case study for the classroom is available for free via the Stigler Center at Chicago Booth
  • [https://www.chicagobooth.edu/research/stigler/education/case-studies](https://www.chicagobooth.edu/research/stigler/education/case-studies)
When is lobbying effective?

When Lobbying amplifies Politicians’ Interests

- Politicians use lobbyists to do more of things they would do on their own since it functions as a legislative subsidy (Hall and Deardorff 2006)
  - Hence, it does not change their constituent focus or arguments that would persuade them
- Politicians will do “good” things when framed in terms they value (Grose and Peterson 2020)
  - E.g. Confederate flag dropped from Mississippi state flag only after Walmart/Cham. of Com. argued it hurt business, not b/c some view it as racist (& others an attack on ‘heritage’)
When is lobbying effective?

When Lobbying amplifies Politicians’ Interests

- Politicians love earmarks in their districts, yet they probably represent the most egregious example of ‘rent-seeking’
- Nevertheless, earmarks lobbyists create can be socially beneficial when they act as “pork that greases the wheels” of political dealmaking
  - Politicians trade votes across valued legislation
  - Contained tax carve-out for new NASCAR track in SW Virginia in an economically challenged locale (Richter Samphanthararak Timmons 2009)
Concluding Thoughts
Although our democracies may exhibit periods of stress and can always be improved, shutting down lobbying & voices is not a solution.

Being Anti-lobbying is Anti-democratic

Fundamentally important to compete on ideas.
Firms & Politics

Literature Largely Ignores Constituents

Political Science
focus on representation

Constituents

Politicians

Firms

Economics
focus on capture/
Management focus on performance

Bridging Academic disciplines is necessary to better understand nature of business-government relationship...
What We need to Know

Unanswered questions for business scholars

• How does lobbying and associated information provision support innovations that improve corporate market stewardship?
  • How do managers plug plans for political advocacy into “fully” integrated strategies that support the social good via product and service innovations?
  • Given the market for virtue is limited, how can astute managers expand the market for virtue via strategic lobbying efforts?
Thanks!
Happy to engage with folks to uncover how corporate lobbying furthers social good

brian.richter@mccombs.utexas.edu

http://briankrichter.com/
twitter: @briankrichter
https://www.linkedin.com/in/bkrichter/